COVID-19's Impact on Liability and Coverage Claims in New York State

Tony Piazza
Mark Whitford

Disclaimer

This PowerPoint and the presentation of Barclay Damon LLP are for informational and educational use only. Neither the PowerPoint nor Barclay Damon's presentation should be considered legal advice. Legal advice is based on the specific facts of a client's situation and must be obtained by individual consultation with a lawyer. Please consult a lawyer before attempting to address any legal situation raised in this seminar.

COVID-19: Liability and Insurance Coverage Claims

Overview
General Liability Claims
Workers' Compensation Claims
Legislative Proposals and Executive Orders
Insurance Coverage for COVID-19 Losses and Trending Litigation
Best Practices for Businesses
COVID-19: General Liability Claims

» Businesses and other organizations may face an influx of personal injury and wrongful death claims arising from COVID-19.

» Health care facilities, grocery stores, restaurants, and other “essential” companies operating during crisis are the initial targets.

» All employers and companies interfacing with customers may have potential liability.

Negligence and Premises Liability

» Duty owed

» Breach of duty
  › Failure to adopt (or timely adopt) measures to prevent spread, such as installing glass shields at cash registers, requiring facemasks, taking employee temperatures, maintaining social distancing, proper sanitization, etc.

» Injury

» Proximate cause
  › Difficult to prove due to widespread and easy transmission of COVID-19

» Premises liability: Actual or constructive notice too

Proximate Cause Issues


» Class-action lawsuit brought by passengers who sustained food-borne illness during cruise

» Cruise line granted summary judgment since no reasonable jury could conclude the illness was caused by the cruise line’s negligence as opposed to another source

» Defendant’s evidence included an epidemiologist who discussed incubation periods and potential sources of illness

» Plaintiffs could not demonstrate that, during the incubation period, the cruise line was the only potential source of illness
COVID-19: Product Liability Claims

» Products: Diagnostic testing, experimental drugs, medical devices, health and hygiene products, PPE
» Defendants: Product manufacturers, suppliers, distributors
» Issues: Failure to properly warn, alleged breach of warranties, failure of device to prevent transmission

COVID-19: General Liability Defenses

» Third-party claims
  › Proximate cause burden on defendant
» Joint and several liability
  › Apportionment of liability among joint tortfeasors
» Plaintiff’s comparative fault
  › E.g., ignoring social-distancing rules and other health and safety guidelines

COVID-19: Workers’ Compensation

» Employers and WC insurers may face an influx of claims from workers claiming they contracted COVID-19 on the job.
  › Workers’ Compensation Law § 2(7) defines “injury” and “personal injury” as “only accidental injuries arising out of and in the course of employment and such disease or infection as may naturally and unavoidably result therefrom.”
  › Exposure alone, without contraction, is likely not enough to result in a compensable claim.
Occupational disease claims

Derived from the nature of employment and result from generally recognized risks incident to a particular occupation.

Case law from tuberculosis epidemic in 1970s:

Nathan v. Presbyterian Hospital, 66 A.D.2d 933 (3d Dep’t 1978):

Affirming board’s decision that a nurse contracted tuberculosis as a result of her exposure to a tubercular patient and concluding the work exposure to which all nurses are subjected is sufficient to meet the essential tests of occupational disease.

Medical professionals may have stronger claim for “occupational disease,” but what about other “essential” services being exposed to disease on an ongoing basis?

Accidental injury claims

Require clear connection between condition and specific traumatic event.

Determined based on the “commonsense viewpoint of the average man” (Claim of Masse v. James H. Robinson Co., 301 N.Y. 34 (1950)).

Thorough investigation required.

Claimant bears burden of proof.

Contraction of communicable diseases in the course of employment

Matter of Donato v. Taconic Crr. Facility, 143 AD3d 1028 (3d Dep’t 2016): Claimant failed to establish that acute bronchitis and a reactive airway disease resulted from an infection contracted while transporting a prisoner aboard a commercial flight; physician conceded the infection could have been contracted anywhere.

Matter of Spoerl v. Armstrong Pumps, Inc., 251 A02d 915 (3d Dep’t 1998): Claimant failed to establish the bacteria responsible for a staph infection was contracted on business trip to England, which is common in both countries, and the source of entry into the body was not established with any medical certainty.
COVID-19: Workers’ Compensation

» Other potential workers’ compensation issues
  › Mental stress claims without contraction
    • A housekeeper at a nursing home was awarded benefits as the employee responsible for cleaning the isolation room and being subjected to stress “greater than normal work environment”
  › Employer’s compliance (or failure to comply) with government guidance regarding protective measures
  › Work-at-home issues

Early COVID-19 Claims

» Illinois wrongful death action filed by a former Walmart employee alleging the store wasn’t properly cleaned and employees weren’t provided appropriate protective equipment
  › Alleges “willful and wanton” misconduct as exception to workers’ compensation bar
» Smithfield Foods, a large pork processor, was sued in federal court in Missouri by a worker advocacy group for allegedly failing to protect workers by having them work “shoulder to shoulder” during the pandemic.
» Several suits against cruise lines for continuing to operate after positive tests on board, including some passengers who died
» Suits in Washington and Georgia against nursing homes for failing to protect residents, several of whom died as a result of COVID-19

Early COVID-19 Claims (cont’d.)

» NY nurses union lawsuit against Montefiore Medical Center (Bronx, NY) for alleged failure to provide N95 respirators and other protective measures dismissed
» Federal class-action lawsuit against Purell for allegedly exaggerating the hand sanitizer’s ability to prevent illness
» Cities of Costa Mesa, CA and San Antonio, TX suing US government for wrongful release of quarantined cruise passengers
» Medical staffing agency suing US Citizenship & Immigration Services for delaying review of H-1B visas for foreign medical professionals
COVID-19: Legislation and Executive Orders Impacting Liability Claims

» NY Executive Order 202.10
» Grants medical professionals immunity from civil liability arising out of COVID-19 treatment
» Exception only where conduct constitutes "gross negligence"
» Constitutionality may be challenged in future medical malpractice claims

COVID-19: Legislation and Executive Orders Impacting Liability Claims (cont’d.)

» US Dep’t of Health & Human Services issued “PREP Act”: Preempts state laws
» Provides immunity to certain individuals and entities arising from manufacturing, distributing, administering, or using "covered countermeasures"
» Broadly defined to include any drug, diagnostic test, or device to treat, diagnose, cure or prevent COVID-19
» Exception only for “willful misconduct”

COVID-19: Legislation and Executive Orders Impacting Liability Claims (cont’d.)

» NY Executive Orders 202.8, 202.14 and 202.18
» Tolls statute of limitations period from March 20 to May 15 (currently, 56 days)
» Passed pursuant to Executive Law giving the governor the power to suspend or “issue any directive” in response to a disaster emergency (passed days before COVID-19 emergency declared)
» Current orders don’t just toll statute of limitations period for claims expiring between March 20 to May 7, but extends all claims accruing during this period
» Impact on claims years after disaster may be challenged as beyond scope of powers
Insurance is an important risk-management tool for businesses to help mitigate losses.

“Business interruption” (or “business income”) coverage compensates the business for these losses (e.g., lost profits, rent).

“Extra expense” coverage is similar but provides a different benefit – covers increased expenses beyond normal operating expenses due to the loss (e.g., having to pay higher rent to use temporary space so the business can continue to operate).

Significantly, there is a time element for the length of this coverage, which can be negotiated.

Myths vs. reality

Fiction:

- No coverage whatsoever for lost revenue resulting from pandemic
- Policies categorically exclude coverage for loss based upon a virus exclusion
**COVID-19: Business Interruption (cont’d.)**

» **Facts:**
  - Every insurance policy is different and should be examined.
    - Which insurer issued the policy?
    - Which coverages were selected?
  - Some policies may provide coverage.
  - If there is a possibility of coverage, businesses will consider submitting a claim.

**COVID-19: Business Interruption (cont’d.)**

» **Sample insuring agreement language:**

   **A. Coverage**

   We will pay for direct physical loss of or damage to Covered Property at the premises described in the Declarations caused by or resulting from any Covered Cause of Loss.

   Covered Causes of Loss means direct physical loss unless the loss is excluded or limited in this policy.

**COVID-19: Business Interruption (cont’d.)**

» **Business interruption coverage typically requires “direct physical loss” to property**
  - Term is usually not defined in policy
  - COVID-19 may or may not involve any such physical damage
  - Question: Was the property exposed to the virus?
  - E.g., Louisiana lawsuit filed March 12: Restaurant seeking business interruption coverage argues potential contamination of property by virus is sufficient to trigger coverage
COVID-19: Business Interruption (cont’d.)

- E.g.: Lawsuit by a group of theaters and restaurants in Chicago seeking BI coverage
  - Filed on March 27 seeking coverage for losses caused by shutdowns due to COVID-19 and alleges bad faith for insurer’s failure to investigate claims before denying coverage
  - Insureds claim that, under Illinois law, presence of dangerous substance on property is sufficient to trigger coverage for “direct physical loss”
  - To be determined ...

COVID-19: Business Interruption (cont’d.)

- Some courts have found that contamination of property is “direct physical loss”
  - Western Fire Ins. Co. v. First Presbyterian Church, 165 Colo. 34, 437 P.2d 52 (Colo. 1968) (gasoline vapor); TRAVCO Ins. Co. v. Ward, 715 F.Supp.2d 699, 709 (E.D. Va. 2010), aff’d, 504 F.App’x 251 (4th Cir. 2013) (vapors from defective drywall)
  - Essex v. BloomSouth Flooring Corp., 562 F.3d 399, 406 (1st Cir. 2009) (unpleasant odor)

COVID-19: Business Interruption (cont’d.)

- Other courts have found that contamination of property is not “direct physical loss”
COVID-19: Business Interruption (cont’d.)

» Virus and bacteria exclusions
  › Even if coverage in the first instance, many policies now have an exclusion for loss caused by an outbreak such as COVID-19
  › Response by insurers following outbreak of SARS in 2000s

COVID-19: Business Interruption (cont’d.)

» Virus and bacteria exclusions – example:
  › ISO form CP 01 40 07 06 “Exclusion for Loss Due to Virus or Bacteria”
    "We will not pay for loss or damage caused by or resulting from any virus, bacterium, or other microorganism that induces or is capable of inducing physical distress, illness, or disease.”
  › Question: Does the exclusion apply if a virus didn’t cause the loss, but a government-mandated shutdown did?

COVID-19: Alternative Coverages

» So, what alternative coverages might exist in your company’s insurance policy?
  › Special endorsements for business interruption and related expenses caused by:
    › Fungus
    › Pollutant cleanup
    › “Communicable disease” endorsement
    › Civil-authority shutdown (e.g., city, county, state)
    › Contingent business interruption
COVID-19: Fungus Coverage

- Fungus
  - Some property policies may contain a sublimit of coverage for costs related to “fungus” cleanup.
  - No requirement of “direct physical loss”
  - E.g. definition of fungus:
    - “Mildew, mold, or other fungi [or] other microorganisms”
  - Could be avenue to coverage for cleanup expenses and other damages

COVID-19: Pollution Coverage

- Pollutant cleanup
  - Similarly, property policies may contain a sublimit of coverage for costs related to “pollutants” cleanup.
  - Again, no requirement of “direct physical loss”
  - E.g. definition of “pollutant”
    - “Solid, liquid, gaseous, or thermal irritant or contaminant”
  - Costs and expenses related to virus may be covered

COVID-19: Communicable Disease Coverage

- Communicable disease endorsement sample:
  - Typically purchased as an add-on coverage
**COVID-19: Civil-Authority Shutdown Coverage/Exclusions**

- Coverage generally only triggered where civil authority:
  - Prohibits access to the insured premises
  - Caused by physical damage to property other than the insured premises
  - Damage to other property must be caused by covered peril
- Thus, unlikely to provide coverage
- Exclusions may also exist that specifically prohibit coverage for "acts or decisions ... of any person, group, organization, or governmental body"

**COVID-19: Contingent Business Interruption**

- Contingent business interruption coverage:
  - Protects against losses by the insured as a result of disruption of the insured’s suppliers or customers
  - E.g.: Shipment of a critical part delayed due to covered event overseas, causing interruption of the insured’s operations
  - Generally requires that the supplier sustains a triggering event or loss (i.e., direct physical loss to its property)

**COVID-19: Legislative Proposals Impacting Coverage**

- Proposed legislation:
  - NJ, OH, NY, MA, and LA introduced bills since the outbreak seeking to compel insurance companies to cover claims by business owners for damages resulting from interruption of their operations due to the COVID-19 emergency
  - Tabled in most states (no federal bill yet)
  - Raises constitutional issues such as due process, violation of "taking clause" of Fifth Amendment, and violation of "contracts clause" of Article I
COVID-19: Business Interruption

> Bottom line
  > Every policy is different and should be examined
  > Depending on facts, law of jurisdiction, and court hearing the case, coverage may exist
  > Monitor proposed legislation

COVID-19: Best Practices

> Locate and have all insurance policies reviewed
  > First-party property policies such as property, pollution, etc.
  > Liability policies such as CGL, business owners, etc.
> Identify relevant policy language
  > Insuring agreement
  > Exclusions? Conditions?
  > Policy endorsements

COVID-19: Best Practices (cont’d.)

> Investigate claims
  > For first-party claims:
    • Identify type of loss or expense and which policy may apply
    • Assemble financial documentation pertaining to damages
  > For third-party claims:
    • Identify which policy coverages may apply
    • Investigate source of exposure – timelines are key